DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY BOARD FOR CORRECTION OF NAVAL RECORDS

2 NAVY ANNEX WASHINGTON DC 20370-5100

BJG

Docket No: 5969-99

1 October 1999

From:

Chairman, Board for Correction of Naval Records

To:

Secretary of the Navy

Subj:

MAJ THE WAS TO SEE TH

REVIEW OF NAVAL RECORD

Ref:

(a) Title 10 U.S.C. 1552

Encl:

- (1) DD Form 149 dtd 21 Jul 99 w/attachments
- (2) HQMC PERB memo dtd 20 Sep 99 w/encl
- (3) HOMC MMOA-4 memo dtd 17 Sep 99
- (4) Subject's naval record
- 1. Pursuant to the provisions of reference (a), Subject, hereinafter referred to as Petitioner, filed enclosure (1) with this Board asking that his naval record be corrected by removing the reviewing officer's comments from his fitness report for 17 August 1996 to 31 March 1997 (copy at Tab A). Enclosure (2) shows the Headquarters Marine Corps (HQMC) Performance Evaluation Review Board (PERB) has directed removal of the contested comments. He further requested removing his failure of selection by the Fiscal Year 2000 Lieutenant Colonel Selection Board, so as to be considered by the selection board scheduled to convene on 19 October 1999 to consider officers of his category for promotion to lieutenant colonel as an officer not failed of selection to that grade. Finally, he requested a special selection board.
- 2. The Board, consisting of Messrs. Brezna, Mazza, and Silberman, began their review of Petitioner's allegations of error and injustice on 29 September 1999, and completed deliberations on 30 September 1999. Pursuant to its regulations, determined that the limited corrective action indicated below should be taken on the available evidence of record. Documentary material considered by the Board consisted of the enclosures, naval records, and applicable statutes, regulations and policies.
- 3. The Board, having reviewed all the facts of record pertaining to Petitioner's allegations of error and injustice, finds as follows:
- a. Before applying to this Board, Petitioner exhausted all administrative remedies available under existing law and regulations within the Department of the Navy.
- b. In correspondence attached as enclosure (3), the HQMC office having cognizance over the subject matter of Petitioner's request to strike his failure of selection for promotion has commented to the effect that this request has merit and warrants favorable action.

CONCLUSION:

Upon review and consideration of all the evidence of record, and especially in light of the contents of enclosure (3), the Board finds the existence of an injustice warranting limited relief, specifically, removal of Petitioner's failure of selection for promotion

The Board finds that Petitioner's request for a special selection board should be denied. In this regard, they note that his regular board is imminent. Further, they feel his consideration by the regular board, with a corrected and in the status of an officer who has not previously failed of selection, will provide him adequate relief.

In view of the above, the following limited corrective action is recommended.

RECOMMENDATION:

- a. That Petitioner's record be corrected so that he will be considered by the earliest possible selection board convened to consider officers of his category for promotion to lieutenant colonel as an officer who has not failed of selection for promotion to that grade.
- b. That any material or entries inconsistent with or relating to the Board's recommendation be corrected, removed or completely expunged from Petitioner's record and that no such entries or material be added to the record in the future.
- c. That any material directed to be removed from Petitioner's naval record be returned to the Board, together with a copy of this Report of Proceedings, for retention in a confidential file maintained for such purpose, with no cross reference being made a part of Petitioner's naval record.
 - d. That Petitioner's request for a special selection board be denied.
- 4. Pursuant to Section 6(c) of the revised Procedures of the Board for Correction of Naval Records (32 Code of Federal Regulations, Section 723.6(c)) it is certified that a quorum was present at the Board's review and deliberations, and that the foregoing is a true and complete record of the Board's proceedings in the above entitled matter.

ROBERT D. ZSALMAN

Recorder

Jonapan A. Rushin JONATHAN S. RUSKIN

Acting Recorder

5. Pursuant to the delegation of authority set out in Section 6(e) of the revised Procedures of the Board for Correction of Naval Records (32 Code of Federal Regulations, Section 723.6(e)) and having assured compliance with its provisions, it is hereby announced that the foregoing corrective action, taken under the authority of reference (a), has been approved by the Board on behalf of the Secretary of the Navy.

W. DEAN PER

Executive Direct



DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY HEADQUARTERS UNITED STATES MARINE CORPS 3280 RUSSELL ROAD QUANTICO, VIRGINIA 22134-5103

IN REPLY REFER TO: 1610 MMER/PERB 15 SEP 1999

From:

Commandant of the Marine Corps

To:

Subi:

CORRECTION OF NAVAL RECORD

Ref:

(a) MCO 1610.11C

Per the reference, the Performance Evaluation Review Board has reviewed allegations of error and injustice in your Naval record. Having reviewed all the facts of record, the Board has directed that your Naval record will be corrected by removing therefrom the Reviewing Officer's comments only for the following fitness report:

Date of Report

Reporting Senior

Reporting Period

2 Sep 97



960817 to 970331 (CH)

- There will be inserted in your Naval record a memorandum in place of the removed comments. The memorandum will state that the comments have been removed by order of the Commandant of the Marine Corps, and may not be made available to selection boards and other reviewing authorities; that such boards may not conjecture or draw inference as to the nature of the comments.
- The Commandant of the Marine Corps is not empowered to grant or deny the removal of failure(s) of selection from a Naval record. Accordingly, your case will be forwarded to the Board for Correction of Naval Records (BCNR) for consideration of that issue.



By direction



DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY HEADQUARTERS UNITED STATES MARINE CORPS 3280 RUSSELL ROAD QUANTICO, VIRGINIA 22134-5103

IN REPLY REFER TO:

1600 MMOA-4 17 Sep 99

MEMORANDUM FOR THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, BOARD FOR CORRECTION OF NAVAL RECORDS

Subj: BCNR PETITION FOR MACOUNTY OF SUBJECT OF SUBJECT

Ref: (a) MMER Request for Advisory Opinion in the case of Major Of 15 Sep 99

- 1. Recommend approval of selection. This recommendation gives the benefit of the doubt.
- 2. Per the reference, we reviewed the stress record and petition. He failed selection on the FY00 USMC Lieutenant Colonel Selection Board. Subsequently, he successfully petitioned the Performance Evaluation Review Board (PERB) for removal of the Reviewing Officer comments from the Change of Reporting Senior fitness report of 960817 to 97033 requests removal of his failure of selection.
- 3. In our opinion, removal of the Reviewing Officer comments enhance the competitiveness of the record. While we recognize the record retains other jeopardy, we believe afforded the benefit of the doubt and have the failure of selection removed.

4. Point of Contact is Lieuten and a late at

Lieutenant Colonel, U.S. Marine Corps Head, Officer Counseling and Evaluation Section Officer Assignment Branch Personnel Management Division



DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY HEADQUARTERS UNITED STATES MARINE CORPS 3280 RUSSELL ROAD QUANTICO, VIRGINIA 22134-5103

IN REPLY REFER TO: 1610 MMER 20 Sep 99

MEMORANDUM FOR THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, BOARD FOR CORRECTION OF NAVAL RECORDS

Subj: BCNR APPLICATION IN THE CASE TO THE CASE TO THE USMC

Encl: (1) Copy of CMC ltr 1610 MMER/PERB of 15 Sep 99

(2) CMC Advisory Opinion 1600 MMOA-4 of 17 Sep 99

1. As evidenced by enclosure (1), PERB removed for the series official military record, the Reviewing Officer's comments appended to his fitness report for the period 960817 to 970331 (CH).

2. We defer to BCNR on the issue of the removal of his failure of selection to the grade of Lieutenant Colonel. Enclosure (2) is furnished to assist in resolving that matter.

Manager 12

nead, Performance Evaluation Review Branch Personnel Management Division By direction of the Commandant of the Marine Corps