

DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY BOARD FOR CORRECTION OF NAVAL RECORDS 701 S. COURTHOUSE ROAD, SUITE 1001 ARLINGTON, VA 22204-2490

> Docket No. 489-23 Ref: Signature Date



Dear Petitioner:

This is in reference to your application for correction of your naval record pursuant to Section 1552 of Title 10, United States Code. After careful and conscientious consideration of relevant portions of your naval record and your application, the Board for Correction of Naval Records (Board) found the evidence submitted insufficient to establish the existence of probable material error or injustice. Consequently, your application has been denied.

Although your application was not filed in a timely manner, the Board found it in the interest of justice to waive the statute of limitations and consider your case on its merits. A three-member panel of the Board, sitting in executive session, considered your application on 23 February 2023. The names and votes of the members of the panel will be furnished upon request. Your allegations of error and injustice were reviewed in accordance with administrative regulations and procedures applicable to the proceedings of this Board. Documentary material considered by the Board consisted of your application, together with all material submitted in support thereof, relevant portions of your naval record and applicable statutes, regulations and policies, as well as the 3 January 2023 decision by the Marine Corps Performance Evaluation Review Board (PERB), and the 14 September 2022 Advisory Opinion (AO) provided to the PERB by the Manpower Management Division Records and Performance Branch (MMRP-30). The PERB decision and the AO were provided to you on 3 January 2023. Although you were afforded an opportunity to submit a rebuttal, you chose not to do so.

The Board determined that your personal appearance, with or without counsel, would not materially add to their understanding of the issues involved. Therefore, the Board determined that a personal appearance was not necessary and considered your case based on the evidence of record.

The Board carefully considered your request to remove your 9 June 2016 to 8 January 2017 Fitness Report. The Board considered your contentions that although the comments written by the Reporting Senior were some of the best you have seen, the relative value (RV) was an 80, the lowest possible rating, and not a reflection of your performance. The Board also considered your contention that you will be looked at for Top Level School.

The Board, however, substantially concurred with the AO and the PERB Decision that the report is valid as written and filed, in accordance with the applicable Performance Evaluation System (PES) Manual guidance. In this regard, the Board noted that there is no PES scale to "match" RS comments and attribute markings, nor is any such scale feasible. Further, the Board noted that a low relative value does not constitute grounds for relief. Finally, regarding your contention that you will be on a board for Top Level School, the Board noted that perceived competitiveness of a report is not a basis for removing or modifying a report. The Board thus concluded that your request is lacking in substantial evidence of error or injustice of the fitness report in question. Accordingly, given the totality of the circumstances, the Board determined that your request does not merit relief.

You are entitled to have the Board reconsider its decision upon submission of new matters, which will require you to complete and submit a new DD Form 149. New matters are those not previously presented to or considered by the Board. In this regard, it is important to keep in mind that a presumption of regularity attaches to all official records. Consequently, when applying for a correction of an official naval record, the burden is on the applicant to demonstrate the existence of probable material error or injustice.

Sincerely.

		3/21/2023	
	Executive Director		
	Signed by:		

2